The Maryland State Board of Education met in regular session on Tuesday, October 24, 2017 at 9:00 a.m. at the Nancy S. Grasmick State Education Building. The following members were in attendance: Mr. Andrew R. Smarick, President; Dr. Chester E. Finn, Jr., Vice President; Dr. Michele Jenkins Guyton; Dr. Justin M. Hartings; Ms. Stephanie R. Iszard; Dr. Rose Maria Li; Mr. Michael D. Phillips; Dr. David Steiner; Mr. Kyle J. Smith, student Board member; and Dr. Karen B. Salmon, State Superintendent of Schools. Dr. Irene M. Zoppi Rodriquez was not in attendance.

The following staff members were present: Elizabeth Kameen, Esq., Assistant Attorney General; Dr. Carol Williamson, Deputy State Superintendent, Office of Teaching and Learning; Kristy Michel, Deputy State Superintendent, Office of Finance and Administration; and Dr. Sylvia Lawson, Deputy State Superintendent, Office of School Effectiveness; and Dr. Miya T. Simpson, Executive Director, Office of the State Board.

President Smarick called the meeting to order and opened with the Pledge of Allegiance.

President Smarick welcomed members and staff of the Maryland Association of Boards of Education (MABE) and other guests.

CONSENT AGENDA

President Smarick called for a motion to approve the Consent Agenda, which included the following items:
- Minutes for September 7, 2017 and September 19, 2017
- Personnel
- Budget Adjustments for September, 2017
- National Board Candidates

Dr. Hartings offered amendments to the minutes under the State Superintendent’s Report – Office of Research and Strategic Data Use Overview, to include the following language: “A board member asked how the Department would evaluate an outside research proposal for alignment with the MSDE research agenda. The board member asked specifically whether a proposal would have to be specific to MSDE, or whether a research proposal that would more broadly benefit the general body of education literature and research would also be considered to be aligned with the MSDE research agenda. Dr. Shaw responded that she believed the latter proposal would be consistent with the Office’s mission and expectations.”

ACTION: Upon motion by Dr. Steiner and seconded by Dr. Guyton, the Board unanimously approved the Consent Agenda, which included the minutes for September 7th and 19th, personnel actions, budget adjustments for September, 2017, and confirmation of candidates to participate in the 2017-2018 Fee Incentive Program established for public school teachers seeking
certification by the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS). (In Favor: 8; opposed: 0; abstained: 0)

**ORAL ARGUMENT**
The State Board heard the case of *Yvette Finley-Gaines v. Montgomery County Board of Education*. Ms. Kameen explained the procedures by which the Board hears oral arguments and introduced Daniel Mahone, Esq., representing Yvette Finley-Gaines (Appellant) and Judith Bresler, Esq., representing Montgomery County Board of Education

**PUBLIC COMMENT**
President Smarick explained the guidelines by which the Board hears public comments. The following individuals provided public comments:

- David Sloan – Regarding support for *Maryland Meals for Achievement* and helping more students in Maryland get the nutrition they need to succeed in school.
- Jaclyn Paris – Regarding *Right to Read* and using structured literacy to support reading instruction and teacher training to help students learn to read.
- Andra Broadwater – Regarding *Start School Later* and consideration of delaying school start times for Maryland students.
- Dr. Jerome Dancis – Regarding PARCC Algebra Results and implications for students who meet and exceed expectations.
- Mary Ann Mears – Regarding improving Arts Education in Maryland Schools.

**TEACHER INDUCTION, RETENTION, AND ADVANCEMENT (TIRA) - SB 493**
(*Presenters: Ms. Mary Gable, Assistant State Superintendent, Division of Student, Family, and School Support; Sarah Spross, Assistant State Superintendent, Division of Educator Effectiveness* )

Ms. Spross provided an overview of SB 493 and an update on the final recommendations of the Teacher Induction, Retention, and Advancement Act of 2016 Workgroup. In the 2016 Maryland General Assembly, legislation was passed concerning teacher retention and induction. Chapter 740 (Senate Bill 493) - Teacher Induction, Retention and Incentive Act of 2016 altered incentives provided for teachers and created a new voluntary pilot program for first-year teachers to allow more time for planning, peer observation, and mentoring. Additionally, the Act required the Maryland State Department of Education (MSDE) to facilitate a group of stakeholders to include representatives of primary and secondary education, higher education, and education policy experts to determine effective recruitment, retention, and the promotion of quality educators at all levels. The workgroup was required to deliver an interim report to the Governor and the General Assembly on November 1, 2016, and to submit a final report on November 1, 2017.
Chapter 740 requires the reports to include:

- findings related to national board certification;
- teacher recertification;
- loan forgiveness;
- induction best practice;
- legislative changes that will ensure that teacher academies, as authorized under the Every Student Succeeds Act, will be of the highest quality and rigor if they are implemented in Maryland, and that the individuals that participate in these academies will be fully prepared and trained to be in a classroom in Maryland;
- a coordinated statewide strategy for recruiting, retaining, and promoting quality teachers at all levels of education; and
- the best methods of incentivizing effective teachers who choose to teach in low-performing schools and schools with a critical mass of economically disadvantaged students.

Ms. Spross presented the recommendations developed by TIRA subcommittee and workgroup members, and MSDE’s response to the recommendations. Final recommendations from the workgroup fall into four categories:

- Standards and accountability for educator preparation programs in Maryland;
- Certification of Maryland educators;
- Financial incentives for the recruitment and retention of teachers; and
- Mentoring and professional development for current teachers.

Ms. Spross discussed the worsening teacher shortage that is being experienced nationally and in Maryland, and the declining completion rates in educator preparation programs. She explained that these changes have caused some states to respond by adjusting the entrance requirements into their teacher preparation programs to keep pace with recruitment needs. She also noted that Maryland currently imports nearly 60 percent of its teachers from out-of-state.

President Smarick and Dr. Finn questioned whether “adjusting entrance requirements” meant lowering the bar. Ms. Spross agreed that some would say that and went on to explain that some would also say it is not just about changing the requirements to enter a preparation program but also to receive a certificate to teach in Maryland.

Dr. Hartings noted that given that 60 percent of Maryland’s teachers come from elsewhere, that has to guide certification considerations and policy.

Ms. Spross acknowledged the concerns of Board members and that teacher preparation and certification go hand in hand. In response to a question from Dr. Finn regarding the direction of the presentation and follow-up, Ms. Spross explained that the purpose of today’s presentation was to provide the Board with the opportunity to hear the recommendations of the Committees and the work groups before the report was submitted to the General Assembly. The next step is for the department to bring back a comprehensive plan to the State Board and the Professional
Standards for Teacher Education Board (PSTEB) outlining where they believe the recommendations need to fall for each Board’s consideration and policy decisions.

Board members also inquired about the availability of training in implicit bias and cultural competencies in teacher preparation programs and discussed the importance of raising standards and accountability measures for Maryland’s teacher preparation programs and why some teachers who begin their careers in Maryland leave after a few years to go to work in other states.

Presented Smarick suggested forming a small committee/workgroup of Board members to work with and attend some of the meetings of the TIRA workgroup and report back to the Board Ms. Iszard, Dr. Finn, and Dr. Steiner volunteered to serve on this workgroup.

ACTION: None. For information and discussion only.

GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS
(Presenters: Dr. Carol Williamson, Deputy Superintendent for Teaching and Learning; Dr. Doug Strader, Director, Planning and Assessment)

Dr. Williamson opened the discussion about graduation requirements and the Bridge Plan for Academic Validation. Dr. Williamson reminded Board members that this is a follow up to last month’s discussion, which included making language changes to the COMAR requirement and removing from that regulation the incremental scores that were previously set. She explained that the presentation today would focus on recommendations for the passing score and the use and rationale behind the use of a cohort model.

Dr. Strader presented a review of assessment requirements and proposed recommendations for passing scale scores for English 10 and Algebra, as well as a cohort approach for addressing the introduction of new assessment requirements. The MSDE recommended adopting a score of 725 for all graduating classes prior to the graduating class of 2023-24, and monitoring assessment data annually for possible adjustments to the passing score.

Dr. Strader discussed the implementation timeline of the Maryland College and Career Readiness Standards and the rationale to be considered in adopting a cohort approach, framing this discussion around the consideration that when setting passing scores, it should also be taken into account when it is reasonable to expect full demonstration of the mastery of the breadth and depth of the CCR Standards once students have been exposed.

Dr. Strader presented information on the counts of students (by grade) achieving 725 or higher and 750 or higher for cohorts starting with grade 5, as well as information about the passing rates. He noted that it is best to start a cohort model with current sixth graders, which is the first cohort to have been introduced and fully exposed to the full breadth and depth of Maryland’s CCR Standards. He explained that it makes sense to start with the 6th grade class because if you start with a cohort following that class, for instance, starting with a typical 9th grade class, you would be missing half of those students that have taken the Algebra I assessment in middle school.

Dr. Williamson commented that students should be exposed to the curriculum if being assessed on it, adding that teachers should also be adequately trained to implement them before students
are tested. Dr. Guyton agreed that there should be a focus on the reasonable timeline for teachers to have mastered the material so that we can realistically expect students to be able to master it. Dr. Finn agreed but also noted that the current accountability system hinges on student performance rather than teacher mastery.

President Smarick expressed disagreement with the idea that students cannot be held accountable for their performance/progress just because every student has not been exposed to the standards and believes “we should not have to wait.” Dr. Salmon agreed, but believes that consideration must be given for and/or in cases of high stakes tests.

Board members engaged in a lengthy discussion about its previous decision to apply an incremental approach, which set 725 as the initial passing score with annual incremental changes (8 points per year) that were to begin in the current year. Board members expressed concerns about waiting to raise the score from 725 and decreasing the score requirement(s) previously agreed upon. Dr. Li also expressed concerns about arbitrarily choosing a number as a passing score instead of basing it on what it is believed that students should know by the time they graduate, and putting more resources into helping students get to that point.

Board members also discussed what a Maryland high school diploma does and should mean, and whether it indicates a student is/should be college ready, and the requirements necessary for earning the diploma. Dr. Williamson noted that many states are grappling with this issue of students successfully completing curriculum requirements but not passing assessment requirements necessary to earn the diploma. The discussion also focused on whether the state should have different designations or versions of diplomas such as one that denotes college readiness and another that signifies an acceptable standard of course completion but not the requirements for college readiness. Ms. Iszard expressed concerns about the potential for this approach to set up a dual track system that could negatively impact certain groups of students, particularly students of color, as has been seen with the disproportionate number of African-American students who participate in the Bridge option.

Dr. Finn made a motion that the cohort that is expected to graduate from high school in 2023-24 and all subsequent cohorts will be deemed to have passed the State’s Assessments if students taking those assessments achieve a score of 750, and that the score of 725 will continue for the current cohort of students (currently in the 7th grade and above).

Upon further discussion, President Smarick expressed concerns about lowering the passing score of 725 from the incremental increases that were previously agreed to by the Board (which should have been increased to 733 for the current year). Ms. Iszard expressed concerns and her opinion that “students should have a level playing field and access to the quality curriculum and instruction they deserve.” Dr. Hartings said he is “hesitant to codify that to have a Maryland diploma you need to be college ready,” and stated that he is not ready to do that but would support the motion for the sake of the cohort model. Dr. Guyton indicated she would be opposed for reasons she has stated previously regarding the cut off being “arbitrary and unreasonable. “

**ACTION:** Upon motion by Dr. Finn, seconded by Dr. Steiner, the Board approved a passing score of 750 for the cohort that is expected to graduate from high school in 2023-24 and
subsequent cohorts, and a passing score of 725 for the students currently in the 7th grade and above.

(In favor: 6 – Dr. Finn, Ms. Iszard, Dr. Steiner, Dr. Li, Dr. Hartings, Pastor Phillips; 
Opposed: 3 – President Smarick, Dr. Guyton, Mr. Smith; 
Abstained: 0)

BRIDGE PLAN FOR ACADEMIC VALIDATION
(Presenter: Dr. Carol Williamson, Deputy Superintendent for Teaching and Learning; Dr. Doug Strader, Director, Planning and Assessment)

Dr. Williamson provided an overview of the Bridge Plan for Academic Validation, to include the purpose of the Bridge Plan and how it was developed and has been revised over time. She also discussed eligibility requirements for participation in Bridge and the validation, review and scoring process. In response to requests from Board members during the October meeting, Dr. Williamson also provided information regarding assessment requirements and alternative methods utilized in other states.

There was extensive discussion among Board members and concerns regarding who utilizes the Bridge option as an alternative (highlighting the disproportionate number of African American students enrolled in Bridge), selection procedures, completion rates, and the validity and rigor of Bridge projects. Dr. Steiner commented that the current percentages of students graduating from schools in Maryland through a Bridge project with an almost dismal pass rate is unacceptable.

Ms. Iszard voiced concerns regarding Bridge producing separate pathways that could lead to separate lives for students and that there should be a standard for the State and “a better way of producing a better system that can cause students not to have a separate pathway”. She suggested inviting leaders from the LEAs to speak at a future meeting about how Bridge projects are implemented.

Pastor Phillips agreed with Ms. Iszard’s concerns and suggested having listening tours throughout the state to hear from district leaders and other stakeholders.

President Smarick agreed that listening is important but expressed his desire to take a firmer line on this.

Dr. Shaw shared data in response to the Board’s request for information about what is happening in other states related to graduation requirements, assessments, and alternative pathways. Dr. Shaw explained that this is a “moving target, because things are changing from yesterday to today.” Dr. Shaw shared the following findings:

- Approximately 34 states have no assessment requirement, or require students to take an assessment but they are not required to pass in order to graduate
  - 32 of them have no requirement
  - An additional 2 of them, allow students to take it and it is factored into the course grade. Students have to pass that course in order to graduate, but do not need to pass the assessment in order to graduate
Of the remaining 17 states with no assessment requirement about 17 of them have an alternative pathway that does not require assessment. They may have alternative pathways that also do require assessment, but those alternative pathways range among a variety of options (portfolio, waiver, exemption by the principal, remedial course work, etc.).

Regarding how students get into the alternative pathway or the no assessment pathway that also varies by state. In some states, if you fail once you are on the alternative track or you take alternative assessments; some have multiple steps to that; some have a minimum threshold on the exam.

Based on the information she was able to obtain, Dr. Shaw concluded that Maryland’s pathways are comparable to what is happening in other states. She said it is unclear, however, whether the disproportionate use of the pathway for certain populations is comparable because that data is not readily available or made public by states.

Following further discussion about alternative pathways and differentiated diplomas, President Smarick presented a motion to direct the MSDE staff to provide the Board with information investigating the pros and cons and different ways of going about differentiating students high school performance on their diploma (whether it’s an endorsement or different types of diploma’s), recognizing different levels of performance coming out of high school through the diploma. There was general support of the motion. Dr. Guyton, Ms. Iszard and Mr. Smith underscored that their support is for an investigation and information to be brought back to the Board.

**ACTION:** Upon motion by President Smarick and seconded by Dr. Steiner, the motion was unanimously approved. (In favor: 9; Opposed: 0; Abstained: 0).

**BOARD REPORTS AND PLANNING**

**Mental Health Committee Update:**
(Presenters: Dr. Sylvia Lawson, Deputy Superintendent for School Effectiveness; Mr. Walter Sallee, Director, Division of Student, Family and School Support; and Dr. Deborah Nelson, Section Chief, School Safety and Climate and Specialist, School Psychological Services)

An overview of the work of the Mental Health Committee. The Committee was created in July 2016 with the support of the State Board and State Superintendent and under the leadership of Dr. Guyton and Ms. Iszard. The Committee was formed to address concerns regarding student mental health and explore best practices for supporting students and LEAs in addressing issues. Suicide prevention and human trafficking emerged as two primary areas of focus. The Committee met regularly for than a year, engaging various State partners in discussions around existing efforts to address student mental health and recommendations for specific actions for consideration by MSDE and the State Board.

Specific committee activities and accomplishments include:
• Conducted a needs assessment among LEAs to identify current programs and practices.
• Collaborated with national, State and local experts.
• Reviewed relevant State statutes, regulations, and policies.
• Examined national examples of State Board approaches to addressing student mental health.
• Identified evidence-based practices.
• Developed the Resource Guide of Maryland School Mental Health and Wellness Programs (http://www.marylandpublicschools.org/about/Pages/DSFSS/SSSP/Suicide/index.aspx)
• Created two new websites to provide information to districts regarding youth suicide (http://www.marylandpublicschools.org/about/Pages/DSFSS/SSSP/Suicide/index.aspx) and human trafficking (http://marylandpublicschools.org/about/Pages/DSFSS/SSSP/CAN-HT/index.aspx)

The committee identified the following priorities:
• Increase awareness and visibility (Awareness).
• Provide statewide guidance, professional development, and technical assistance/support (Guidance).
• Gather and maintain relevant local and statewide data on the effectiveness of programs and practices to evaluate effectiveness (Evaluation).
• Encourage/facilitate coordination and collaboration among local school systems, state agencies, policy makers, and community partners (Coordination and Collaboration).
• Identify policy gaps and opportunities to strengthen existing regulations to ensure the necessary supports at the State and local levels (Policy/Regulations).

The following recommendations were presented:

**Suicide:**
• Acknowledge, recognize, and facilitate State and local school system awareness of mental health concerns of youth.
• Provide continuous updated statewide guidance and comprehensive training for staff (to include educators, administrators, student services personnel) around mental health, with an initial focus on suicide prevention, to increase knowledge and skills of supporting students at risk for suicide.
• Develop mechanisms to determine the impact of suicide prevention programs.
• Explore and share with local school systems external funding opportunities to leverage partnerships with state agencies and national organizations to promote coordination of youth suicide prevention efforts.
• Develop regulations and policies to support school staff in delivering uniform and equitable services to students with mental health concerns, particularly students at risk for suicide.
**Human Trafficking:**

- Promote collaboration and alignment among mental health awareness efforts within the MSDE and across the State in order to emphasize the link between mental health, trauma, and human trafficking.
- Consult and collaborate with state-level agencies, school staff, and partners to develop guidance for local school systems around comprehensive child abuse policy, procedures, and training, which include human trafficking.
- Ensure that uniform evaluation measures are used to monitor the effectiveness of training.
- Facilitate coordinated and collaborative efforts among agencies on human trafficking prevention.
- Ensure that local procedures for reporting child abuse are updated to include human trafficking.

President Smarick thanked Dr. Guyton and Ms. Iszard for their leadership and dedication to this important issue. Dr. Guyton thanked the Board for their support and recognition of the importance of supporting the whole child. Dr. Guyton and Ms. Iszard also thanked the staff on the committee for their hard work.

The presenters concluded with a discussion of next steps and future plans for the committee, which include beginning to implement some of the strategies and action plans that have been shared and return to the Board with future updates and policy recommendations.

Board members and Dr. Salmon thanked the committee and staff for their work.

**ACTION:** None. For information and discussion only.

---

**Discussion of tentative agenda items for the December 4th and 5th State Board Meetings:**

- Board members agreed to continue to hold Monday, December 4th for a work session, as needed. The Executive Board will meet on October 31st to discuss and finalize the December meeting agenda.
- Dr. Finn reminded the Board of previous discussions around planning an administrative retreat/work session to review and update Board procedures and policies, and suggested considering the December 4th date for this discussion. President Smarick and Dr. Salmon agreed this is necessary but said they would prefer to wait until appointments for current Board vacancies are made and new members are on board.
- Dr. Li inquired about inviting representatives from the Educational Testing Service (ETS) to a future meeting to present information regarding their teacher licensure and certification assessments and evaluation tools. Dr. Steiner supported this request.
Board Member Updates/Comments:

• President Smarick suggested forming a small policy review committee and volunteered to serve with other Board members who are willing. Dr. Li and Dr. Hartings agreed to serve on the committee. Dr. Simpson will follow up with committee members to schedule a conference call.

• Ms. Iszard requested a session focused on the Bridge Plan and having LEAs come to speak with the Board about their projects and the rationale behind them. Dr. Salmon will work on this and report back to the Board with updates.

• Dr. Guyton agreed to represent the State Board on the Division of Labor, Licensing, and Regulation’s (DLLR) Maryland Adult Learning Advisory Council (MALAC).

ACTION: None. For information and discussion only.

STATE SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT

Update on Office of Research and Strategic Data Use Protocol and Webpage
(Presenter: Dr. Dara Shaw, Executive Director)

Dr. Shaw provided information on the status of external research requests. The External Research Review Committee met in October and provisionally approved a proposal submitted by the Center for Research on Education Outcomes (CREDO) at Stanford University. CREDO was asked to make minor revisions to its proposal (include a timeline and list of all researchers who will have access to the data) and upon receipt of this information the Committee would grant full approval.

Dr. Shaw also provided an update on the new webpage that has been created, which described the Office and directs users to a variety of resources. The webpage also includes guidance for researchers interested in conducting research with MSDE.

ACTION: None. Information and discussion only.

Maryland Center for School Safety
(Presenter: Edward Clarke, Executive Director)

Mr. Clarke provided an overview of the Maryland Center for School Safety. This included its legislative origin, mandated functions and duties, board composition, and key highlights and accomplishments.

ACTION: None. For information and discussion only.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to § 3-305(b)(1)&(7) of the General Provisions Article, Annotated Code of Maryland, and upon motion of President Smarick, seconded by Dr. Finn, and with unanimous agreement, the Maryland State Board of Education met in closed session on Tuesday, October 24, 2017 in
The Executive Session commenced at 1:20 p.m. At that time, the State Board approved three Opinions and five Orders for publication.

- **Kevin and Leah B. v. Howard County Board of Education** – early K entry – Opin. No. 17-38
- **Donna Young v. Prince George’s County Board of Education (II)** – employee termination – Opin. No. 17-39
- **Yvette Finlay-Gaines v. Montgomery County Board of Education** – teacher termination – Opin. No. 17-34
- **Jatin W. v. Montgomery County Board of Education** – residency – **Amended** Order No. OR17-14
- **Heather A. v. Anne Arundel County Board of Education** – residency – Order No. OR17-15
- **Kiona B. v. Anne Arundel County Board of Education** – student transfer – Order No. OR17-16
- **Richard and Julia B. v. Howard County Board of Education** – walking route – Order No. OR17-17
- **Lee Thomassen v. Baltimore County Board of Education** – request for reconsideration – Order No. OR17-18

Kristy Michel explained the status of the Prince George’s County Public Schools audit. The Board received legal advice on their legal options in response to the Prince George’s County Public School System audit.

The State Superintendent disseminated an ESSA Title IV updated without discussion.

The Board and the State Superintendent finalized the goals and priorities on which the Superintendent would be evaluated.

The Executive Session ended at 2:35 p.m.

**RECONVENE**
The Board reconvened in public session at 2:50 p.m.

**STATE SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT**

- **Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers (PARCC) Update**
  (Presenters: Dr. Carol Williamson, Chief Academic Officer; Dr. Doug Strader, Director, Planning and Assessment)

  Report on the supplemental analyses of the 2017 PARCC Results in response to a request from Board members during the September 19th meeting. The analyses included: black/white and other achievement gaps for all subjects; trends in proficiency rates and achievement gaps
(2015-2017), and proficiency rates for FARMS and non-FARMS students, by other selected groups.

**ACTION:** None. For information and discussion only.

➢ **Update on MSDE’s Recent Grants and Awards**

Dr. Salmon and staff informed the Board members about the following grants recently awarded to MSDE:

- **U. S. Department of Education Charter Schools Program Grant**
  Supports the startup, expansion, and replication of public charter schools and promotes quality through technical assistance activities for charter school applicants and local school systems. The initial award is $5,490,859 over a two-year period. (October 1, 2017 – September 30, 2019). The total award is $17,222,222 over five years through September 30, 2022. Grants for years three through five will be dependent on federal appropriations.

  Board members requested future updates regarding the Charter Schools Program Grant.

- **Federal Striving Readers’ Comprehensive Literacy (SRCL) Grant**
  Supports the advancement of literacy skills for all children from birth through grade 12, with special emphasis on disadvantaged children, including children living in poverty, English learners, and children with disabilities. The award is for $45 million over three years. Of the 16 SRCL grants awarded in 2017, Maryland received the third highest award.

- **2017-2018 Broadening Options and Opportunities for Students Today (BOOST) Scholarship Program**
  Provides scholarships for students eligible for the free or reduced-price meal program to attend eligible nonpublic schools. A total of $6.1 million is available for 2017-2018. As of October 2, 2017, $5.5 million had been awarded.

- **Javits Gifted and Talented Students Education Act Grant**
  Supports initiatives to develop and scale up models serving students who are underrepresented in gifted and talented programs. The goals of the grant are to 1) work in partnership with Johns Hopkins University CTE to create an online platform that will be a repository of resources, as well as a collaborative e-community for educators, students, families, researchers, higher education, and community members; and 2) research and develop an equitable state policy and supporting guidelines for the identification of gifted and talented students. Maryland received $323,762 for the first budget period. It is anticipated that the grant will be for 5 years, totaling $1,597,938.
ACTION: None. For information and discussion only.

➤ FINANCIAL REPORTING REQUIREMENTS  
(Presenters: Dr. Karen B. Salmon and Ms. Kristy Michel, Deputy Superintendent for Finance and Administration)

Dr. Salmon and Ms. Michel briefed the State Board on the status of audit reports of local school systems and requested authorization to withhold funds from local school systems that are not in compliance with the provisions of §5-114 of the Education Article. Senate Bill 894. The Education Fiscal Accountability and Oversight Act of 2004 strengthens the authority of the State Superintendent and the State Board to monitor the fiscal health of local school systems and provides for the enforcement of the requirements through the withholding of funds.

Ms. Michel informed the Board that there were currently two systems that had not yet submitted their annual audit reports.

ACTION: Upon motion by Dr. Hartings and seconded by Dr. Steiner, the State Board voted unanimously to authorize the State Superintendent to notify the Comptroller to withhold 10% of the November State aid payment and each subsequent installment for any system that is not in full compliance with §5-114 of the Education Article. (In favor: 8; Opposed: 0; Abstained: 0. President Smarick was not present.)

REGULATORY ACTIONS  
(Presenter: Mary Gable, Assistant State Superintendent, Division of Student, Family, and School Support)

➤ Emergency Planning Guidelines for Local School Systems

An update on the MSDE’s Emergency Planning Guidelines for Local School Systems and request to approve revisions made to the guidelines. The MSDE worked with the Maryland Center for School Safety (MCSS) to convene a diverse workgroup of stakeholders, which included disability advocacy groups, parents, and State and local professionals. Ms. Gable explained that the guidelines, as currently written, are not adequate in terms of what specific factors should be considered in an emergency to accommodate, safeguard, and evacuate individuals with disabilities. The updated guidelines contain specific information that should be considered, based on current best practices, to assist all students, staff, and visitors (including individuals with disabilities) in the event of an emergency.

ACTION: Upon motion by Dr. Finn and seconded by Mr. Smith, the State Board voted unanimously to approve and adopt the updated Emergency Planning Guidelines for Local School Systems and Schools. (In favor: 8; Opposed: 0; Abstained: 0. President Smarick was not present.)

➤ COMAR 13A.07.08 Incentive Program for Certification Alignment (AMEND)
A request for permission to publish proposed changes to the regulation to update and clarify language and align with current National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS).

**ACTION:** Upon motion by Ms. Iszard, with a seconded by Dr. Li, the State Board unanimously granted permission to publish the proposed amendments. (In favor: 8; Opposed: 0; Abstained: 0. President Smarick was not present.)

➤ **COMAR 13A.04.16 Programs in Fine Arts (ADOPTION)**

A request for permission to adopt the proposed amendments to the regulation to incorporate the new National Core Arts Standards and align with recommendations in the Governor’s P-20 Leadership Council Arts Education in Maryland Schools. The final revised draft includes the following recommended changes:

- The inclusion of prekindergarten in fine arts instruction.
- The delineation of experiences in all art forms for students in prekindergarten – grade 5.
- The ability for students in grades 6-8 to specialize in one or more art forms.
- The addition of Media Arts as the 5th art form, as defined by the National Core Arts Standards.
- The inclusion and formalization of the Fine Arts Education Advisory Panel.

**ACTION:** Upon motion by Dr. Steiner, with a second by Ms. Iszard, the State Board approved the adoption of the proposed amendments. (In favor: 8; Opposed: 0; Abstained: 0. President Smarick was not present.)

**OPINIONS**

Ms. Kameen announced the following Opinions and Orders:

- *Kevin and Leah B. v. Howard County Board of Education* – early K entry – Opin. No. 17-38
- *Donna Young v. Prince George’s County Board of Education (II)* – employee termination – Opin. No. 17-39
- *Yvette Finlay-Gaines v. Montgomery County Board of Education* – teacher termination – Opin. No. 17-34
- *Jatin W. v. Montgomery County Board of Education* – residency – Amended Order No. OR17-14; amended the order that was originally issued to indicate that it was a dismissal of the appeal
- *Heather A. v. Anne Arundel County Board of Education* – residency – Order No. OR17-15; dismissed as untimely
- *Kiona B. v. Anne Arundel County Board of Education* – student transfer – Order No. OR17-16; dismissed as untimely
- *Richard and Julia B. v. Howard County Board of Education* – walking route – Order No. OR17-17; dismissed as untimely
•  *Lee Thomassen v. Baltimore County Board of Education* – request for reconsideration – Order No. OR17-18; denied

**ADJOURNMENT**
With no further business before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen B. Salmon, Ph.D.
Secretary/Treasurer

Date: October 24, 2017

*The information included here provides a summary of the agenda items presented and actions taken during the meeting of the Maryland State Board of Education. The audio recordings of the meetings are the official record of the meetings and can be located at: [http://www.marylandpublicschools.org/stateboard/Pages/Meetings-2017.aspx](http://www.marylandpublicschools.org/stateboard/Pages/Meetings-2017.aspx)*
MARYLAND STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
PRESIDING OFFICER’S WRITTEN STATEMENT FOR CLOSING A MEETING (“CLOSING STATEMENT”) UNDER OPEN MEETINGS ACT (General Provisions Article § 3-305)

1. Recorded vote to close the meeting.
   Date: October 24, 2017
   Time: 1:00 p.m.
   Location: 200 West Baltimore Street, Baltimore, MD 21201
   Motion to close meeting made by: Andy Smarick
   Seconded by: Dr. Chester Finn
   Members in favor: 9
   Opposed: 0
   Abstaining: 0
   Absent: 1 (Dr. Irene Zoppi Rodriguez)

2. The meeting was closed under authority of Section 3-305(b) of the General Provisions Article of the Annotated Code of Maryland (check all provisions that apply). This meeting will be closed under General Provision Art. § 3-305(b) only.

   ☑ 1. To discuss: (i) the appointment, employment, assignment, promotion, discipline, demotion, compensation, removal, resignation, or performance evaluation of appointees, employees, or officials over whom this public body has jurisdiction; or (ii) any other personnel matter that affects one or more specific individuals.
   ☐ 2. To protect the privacy or reputation of individuals concerning a matter not related to public business.
   ☐ 3. To consider the acquisition of real property for a public purpose and matters directly related thereto.
   ☐ 4. To consider a matter that concerns the proposal for a business or industrial organization to locate, expand, or remain in the State.
   ☐ 5. To consider the investment of public funds.
   ☐ 6. To consider the marketing of public securities.
   ☑ 7. To consult with counsel to obtain legal advice.
   ☐ 8. To consult with staff, consultants, or other individuals about pending or potential litigation.
   ☐ 9. To conduct collective bargaining negotiations or consider matters that relate to the negotiations.
   ☑ 10. To discuss public security, if the public body determines that public discussion would constitute a risk to the public or to public security, including: (i) the deployment of fire and police services and staff; and (ii) the development and implementation of emergency plans.
   ☐ 11. To prepare, administer, or grade a scholastic, licensing, or qualifying examination.
   ☐ 12. To conduct or discuss an investigative proceeding on actual or possible criminal conduct.
   ☐ 13. To comply with a specific constitutional, statutory, or judicially imposed requirement that prevents public disclosures about a particular proceeding or matter.
   ☐ 14. Before a contract is awarded or bids are opened, to discuss a matter directly related to a negotiating strategy or the contents of a bid or proposal, if public discussion or disclosure would adversely impact the ability of the public body to participate in the competitive bidding or proposal process.

3. For each provision checked above, disclosure of the topic to be discussed and the public body’s reason for discussing that topic in closed session.

   Citation (insert # from above)  |   Topic                  |   Reason for closed-session discussion to topic
   § 3-305(b) (1)                  |   Internal Board Management | State Superintendent performance evaluation.
   § 3-305(b) (7)                  |   Legal Advice            | Obtained legal advice on legal appeals and Prince George’s County Public Schools audit.

4. This statement is made by ______________________________, Presiding Officer.
MARYLAND STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
PERSONNEL APPROVALS FOR THE October 24, 2017 BOARD MEETING

I. Appointments Grade 19 and above:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>POSITION</th>
<th>SALARY GRADE</th>
<th>DIVISION/ OFFICE</th>
<th>DATE OF APPOINTMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boone, Jody L.</td>
<td>Vocational Rehabilitation Director III – Office of Field Services/Client Services</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Finance and Administration, Division of Rehabilitation Services</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ford, Gregg K.</td>
<td>Education Program Specialist I, Technology Accessibility Specialist</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Teaching and Learning, Division of Curriculum, Research, Assessment and Accountability</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powell, Holly L.</td>
<td>Education Program Specialist II, Nonpublic School Approval Specialist(s)</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for School Effectiveness, Division of Educator Effectiveness</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renzi, Leah O.</td>
<td>Education Program Supervisor, Coordinator of Social Studies</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Teaching and Learning, Division of Curriculum, Research, Assessment and Accountability</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torchon, Martha A.</td>
<td>Education Program Specialist II – Program for Assessment of Students with Disabilities</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Finance and Administration, Division of Rehabilitation Services</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. Appointments Grade 18 and below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>POSITION</th>
<th>SALARY GRADE</th>
<th>DIVISION/ OFFICE</th>
<th>DATE OF APPOINTMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deans, Michael</td>
<td>Human Resources Officer I</td>
<td>15/10</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Finance and Administration, Office of Human Resources</td>
<td>10/11/17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## II. Appointments Grade 18 and below (con’t):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>POSITION</th>
<th>SALARY GRADE</th>
<th>DIVISION/OFFICE</th>
<th>DATE OF APPOINTMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hasnain, Sohail</td>
<td>Vocational Rehabilitation Specialist II</td>
<td>13/3</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Finance and Administration, Division of Rehabilitation Services</td>
<td>10/11/17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myers, Manuela</td>
<td>Administrator II</td>
<td>17/16</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Finance and Administration, Division of Rehabilitation Services</td>
<td>10/11/17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pensyl, Matthew L.</td>
<td>Teacher, Academic</td>
<td>IEPP</td>
<td>Deputy State Superintendent, Office of School Effectiveness, Juvenile Services Education System</td>
<td>09/25/17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piette, Craig R.</td>
<td>Teacher, History/Office Systems Management</td>
<td>IEPP</td>
<td>Deputy State Superintendent, Office of School Effectiveness, Juvenile Services Education System</td>
<td>09/27/17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodriguez, Cynthia</td>
<td>Vocational Rehabilitation Specialist II</td>
<td>13/3</td>
<td>Office of the Deputy for Finance and Administration, Division of Rehabilitation Services</td>
<td>10/11/17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stegall, William G.</td>
<td>Teacher, Resource</td>
<td>IEPP</td>
<td>Deputy State Superintendent, Office of School Effectiveness, Juvenile Services Education System</td>
<td>09/27/17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vallangca, Evelyn J.</td>
<td>Teacher, Academic</td>
<td>IEPP</td>
<td>Deputy State Superintendent, Office of School Effectiveness, Juvenile Services Education System</td>
<td>09/25/17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## III. Other Actions: Promotional

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>POSITION</th>
<th>SALARY GRADE</th>
<th>DIVISION/OFFICE</th>
<th>DATE OF APPOINTMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
October 24, 2017

BOARD LIST

The following professional appointment is submitted for approval by the State Board of Education:

Name: Jody L. Boone

Position: Vocational Rehabilitation Director III, Office of Field Services/Client Services

Division: Rehabilitation Services, Client Services

Salary Grade: State Salary Grade: 24
Annual Salary Range: $73,612 - $118,197

Effective Date: TBD

JOB REQUIREMENTS:

EDUCATION:
Possession of a Bachelor’s Degree from an accredited college or university with coursework in Management, Supervision and Administration, or a closely related field. A Master’s Degree preferred.

EXPERIENCE:
Eight (8) years of professional experience in rehabilitation or in the adjudication and processing of disability claims is required. Five (5) years of the required experience must have included direct supervision of other professional employees or specialized experience as the technical lead in establishing eligibility and providing rehabilitation services for clients with disabilities or in developing disability claims and establishing eligibility for Social Security Disability Insurance and Supplemental Security Income disability benefits.

DESCRIPTION:
This is a management position serving as the Director of the Division’s Office of Field Services/Client Services Program responsible for planning, directing, administering and implementing a comprehensive, coordinated, efficient, and cost-effective service delivery system to promote the economic and personal independence of persons with significant disabilities through their achievement of maximum independence of competitive integrated employment outcomes consistent with their strengths, preferences, and informed choice.

www.MarylandPublicSchools.org
QUALIFICATIONS:

Education:
The Johns Hopkins University (Baltimore, Maryland) 2004 – Master’s Degree in Clinical Counseling
Hood College (Frederick, Maryland) 2000 – Bachelor’s Degree in Psychology
Howard Community College (Columbia, Maryland) 1988 – Associates Degree in Business Administration

Experience:
Maryland State Department of Education (Baltimore, Maryland)
2005 – Present: Program Manager II, Rehabilitation Services/Technical Assistance Branch
2009 – 2012: Staff Specialist III, Rehabilitation Services/Business Services
2005 – 2009: Vocational Rehabilitation Specialist, Technical Specialist, Rehabilitation Services/Business Liaison
Discovering Options (Silver Spring, Maryland)
2004: Employment Services Coordinator
Frederick County Mental Health Association (Frederick, Maryland)
2003 – 2004: Counseling Intern
Center for Integrative Medicine (Baltimore, Maryland)
1999 – 2004: Clinical Research Assistant
On Earth Peace Assembly (New Windsor, Maryland)
1997 – 1999: Office Manager
Robert J. Temple, M.D., P.A., (Columbia, Maryland)
1995 – 1997: Office Manager
Medical Management Resources, (Central Maryland)
1993 – 1995: Independent Contractor – Medical Services Sales
The Rouse Company (Columbia, Maryland)

EMPLOYMENT STATUS:
Promotional
The following professional appointment is submitted for approval by the State Board of Education:

**Name:** Gregg K. Ford

**Position:** Education Program Specialist I, Technology Accessibility Specialist

**Division:** Curriculum, Research, Assessment, and Accountability

**Salary Grade:** State Salary Grade: 21

Effective Date: TBD

**Annual Salary Range:** $60,543 - $97,203

**JOB REQUIREMENTS:**

**EDUCATION:**
Master’s Degree or equivalent 36 credit hours of post baccalaureate course work in Special Education, Instructional Technology, Assistive Technology, Web-based Design or a related field.

**EXPERIENCE:**
Four (4) years of professional work experience with assistive technology, digital learning, and accessibility compliance.

**DESCRIPTION:**
This is a professional position responsible for ensuring that all digital products generated by the Maryland State Department of Education (MSDE) are accessible to individuals with disabilities.
QUALIFICATIONS:

Education:
University of Maryland (Adelphi, Maryland) 2005 – Master’s Degree in Distance Education; 2007 – Master’s Degree in Business Administration
Morgan State University (Baltimore, Maryland) 2001 – Bachelor’s Degree in Fine Arts: Graphic Design and Advertising

Experience:
Baltimore City Public Schools (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2011 – 2017:  Manager of Communications Technologies
  2009 – 2011:  Staff Specialist – Engagement & Communications
  2005 – 2011:  Application Developer University of Maryland School Of Nursing
  2005:  Multimedia Specialist
The Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School Of Public Health (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2004 – 2005:  Multimedia Technician

EMPLOYMENT STATUS:
New Hire
October 24, 2017

BOARD LIST

The following professional appointment is submitted for approval by the State Board of Education:

Name: Holly L. Powell

Position: Education Program Specialist II,
Nonpublic School Approval Specialist

Division: Educator Effectiveness

Salary Grade: State Salary Grade: 22
Annual Salary Range: $64,608 – $103,743

Effective Date: TBD

JOB REQUIREMENTS:

EDUCATION:
A Master’s Degree or equivalent 36 post baccalaureate credit hours of course work in Education, Special Education or a related field.

EXPERIENCE:
Five years of professional work experience in education that must include experience in the application of regulations. Administration and/or supervisory experience in a special education setting desirable.

DESCRIPTION:
This a professional position serving as a lead technical specialist responsible for providing leadership, technical and legal expertise in all aspects of the approval of nonpublic educational programs, including those for students with disabilities who are unable to be educated in public schools.
QUALIFICATIONS:

Education:
University of Maryland at Baltimore (Baltimore, Maryland) 2003 – Master’s Degree in Social Work; 1998 – Bachelor’s Degree in Psychology (Child Development)

Board of Social Work Examiners (Baltimore, Maryland) 2006 Licensed Certified Social Worker-Clinical

Experience:
Board of Child Care (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2017 – Present: Clinical Supervisor

Good Shepherd Services (Halethorpe, Maryland)
  2014 – 2017: Related Services Manager

New Pathways, Inc. (Towson, Maryland)
  2010 – 2014: Clinical Supervisor
  2009 – 2010: Case Manager

The Woodbourne Center-Children’s Diagnostic and Treatment Center (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2006 – 2009: Therapist

Board of Child Care-Strawbridge School (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2003 – 2006: Clinical Social Worker

EMPLOYMENT STATUS:
New Hire
The following professional appointment is submitted for approval by the State Board of Education:

Name: Leah Osteen Renzi

Position: Education Program Supervisor, Coordinator of Social Studies

Division: Curriculum, Research, Assessment, and Accountability

Salary Grade: State Salary Grade: 22
Annual Salary Range: $64,608 - $103,743

Effective Date: TBD

JOB REQUIREMENTS:

EDUCATION:
Master’s Degree or equivalent 36 credit hours of post baccalaureate course work in Social Studies or Social Studies Education.

EXPERIENCE:
Five years of professional administrative, accountability or teaching experience in or affiliated with an education program including two (2) years of experience in coordinating or administering an education program or service directly related to Social Studies. Experience with K-12 Social Studies programs preferred.

DESCRIPTION:
This is a professional position responsible for the coordination of all activities of the Office of Social Studies for kindergarten through high school.
QUALIFICATIONS:

Education:
The Johns Hopkins University (Baltimore, Maryland) 2004 - Master’s Degree in Liberal Arts
Cambridge University (Cambridge, England) 2003 - Certification in English Literature
Towson University (Baltimore, Maryland) 1994 - Bachelor’s Degree in Social Science and Secondary Education

Experience:
Baltimore County Public Schools (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2017 – Present: Student and Teacher Accessing Tomorrow (S.T.A.T.) Mentor Teacher, Kenwood High School
  2014 – 2017: Ninth Grade Team Leader and Social Studies Teacher, Overlea High School
  2008 – 2014: Social Studies Teacher, Parkville Middle School
  2002 – 2008: Social Studies Department Chair, Eastern Technical High School
  1999 – 2002: Social Studies Department Chair, Dundalk Middle School
  1995 – 1999: Social Studies Teacher, Randallstown High School

National Center for History Education (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2001 – 2003: Master Teacher

College Board Advanced Placement (Baltimore, Maryland)
  2000 – 2004: Vertical Team Consultant

Pine Ridge Productions (Jacksonville, Florida)
  1995 – 2005: Consultant (part-time)

EMPLOYMENT STATUS:
New Hire
The following professional appointment is submitted for approval by the State Board of Education:

**Name:** Martha A. Torchon  
**Position:** Education Program Specialist II, Program Manager for Assessment of Studies with Disabilities  
**Division:** Curriculum, Research, Assessment and Accountability  
**Salary Grade:** State Salary Grade: 22  
**Effective Date:** TBD

**JOBS REQUIREMENTS:**

**EDUCATION:**
Possession of a Master’s Degree or equivalent 36 credit hours of post-baccalaureate course work from an accredited college or university.

**EXPERIENCE:**
Five (5) years of administrative or teaching experience in or affiliated with an education program; this experience to include coordinating or administering an education program or education assessment related area. Experience in analysis, assessment, and research within programs serving student with disabilities is preferred.

**NOTE:**
Two additional years of experience directly related to the position may be Substituted for the required Master’s Degree.

**DESCRIPTION:**
The purpose of this position is to manage the implementation of the Maryland State assessment programs as they relate to students with disabilities. Areas of responsibility will be to serve as the Project Manager for all alternate assessments to include the Alternate Maryland School Assessment (Alt-MSA) for science and the National Center for State Collaborative (NCSC) for reading and mathematics, for students with significant cognitive disabilities as required by the federal Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA) and the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA).
QUALIFICATIONS:

Education:
James Madison University (Harrisonburg, Virginia) 2001 – Bachelor’s Degree in Psychology with (Special Education Teaching Certification) minor in Special Education

Experience:
Maryland State Department of Education (Baltimore, Maryland)
   2016 – Present: Education Program Specialist II – Alternative Assessments Coordinator
Pearson, Inc. (Virginia Beach, Virginia)
   2008 – 2016: Senior Scoring Specialist
   2007 – 2008: Scorer/Supervisor
Chesapeake Public Schools (Chesapeake, Virginia)
   2001 – 2004: Special Education Teacher

EMPLOYMENT STATUS:
Promotional